

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:21-cv-02380-BAH**

PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS et al Date Filed: 09/09/2021
v. COLLINS et al Date Terminated: 04/03/2023
Assigned to: Judge Beryl A. Howell Jury Demand: None
Case in other court: USCA, 23-05110 Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Cause: 28:1331 Federal Question: Other Civil Rights Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL
TREATMENT OF ANIMALS**

represented by **Asher Smith**
PETA FOUNDATION
501 Front Street
Norfolk, VA 23510
202-540-2177
Email: ashers@petaf.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Amy Fallow
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York, NY 10115
646-745-8500
Email: Katie.Fallow@knightcolumbia.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephanie Krent
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York City, NY 10115
646-745-8500
Email: stephanie.krent@knightcolumbia.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alyssa Morones
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA

UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York City, NY 10115
646-745-8500
Email: alyssa.morones@knightcolumbia.org
TERMINATED: 12/22/2022
PRO HAC VICE

Lyndsey Marie Wajert
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York City, NY 10115
267-566-5883
Email: lwajert@vedderprice.com
TERMINATED: 09/15/2021
PRO HAC VICE

Jameel Jaffer
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York, NY 10115
(646) 745-8500
Email: jameel.jaffer@knightcolumbia.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MADELINE KRASNO

represented by **Katherine Amy Fallow**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephanie Krent
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alyssa Morones
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 12/22/2022
PRO HAC VICE

Caitlin Mairead Foley
ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE FUND
150 South Wacker
Suite 2400

Chicago, IL 60606
707-795-2533
Email: cfoley@aldf.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lyndsey Marie Wajert
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/15/2021
PRO HAC VICE

Jameel Jaffer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

RYAN HARTKOPF

represented by **Katherine Amy Fallow**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephanie Krent
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alyssa Morones
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 12/22/2022
PRO HAC VICE

Caitlin Mairead Foley
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lyndsey Marie Wajert
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/15/2021
PRO HAC VICE

Jameel Jaffer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

FRANCIS M. COLLINS
in his official capacity as Director of the
National Institutes of Health

represented by **Kuntal Virendra Cholera**
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
1100 L. St. NW

Defendant

XAVIER BECERRA

*in his official capacity as Secretary of the
U.S. Department of Health and Human
Services*

represented by **Kuntal Virendra Cholera**

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/09/2021	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS (Filing fee \$ 402 receipt number ADCDC-8720589) filed by PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS, RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment 1, # <u>2</u> Attachment 2, # <u>3</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>4</u> Certificate Rule LCvR 26.1, # <u>5</u> Summons for Francis M. Collins, # <u>6</u> Summons for Xavier Becerra)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Katie Fallow, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-8720860. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021	<u>3</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Stephanie Krent, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-8720867. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021	<u>4</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Lyndsey Wajert, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-8720901. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021	<u>5</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Caitlin M. Foley, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-8720909. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021	<u>6</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Asher Smith, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-8720915. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/09/2021		NOTICE OF ERROR re <u>1</u> Complaint; emailed to jameel.jaffer@knightcolumbia.org, cc'd 2 associated attorneys -- The PDF file you docketed contained errors: 1. Noncompliance with LCvR 5.1(c). Please file an errata correcting the initiating pleading to include the name & full residence address of each party using the event Errata., 2. Pleading filed as attachment. Please file pleading as separate entry., 3. Missing 26.1

		Disclosure(s). Please submit using the event LCvR 26.1 Certificate of Disclosure-Corporate Affiliations/Financial Interests. (zsb,) (Entered: 09/09/2021)
09/10/2021	7	ERRATA (<i>correcting initiating pleading</i>) by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Attachment 1, # 2 Attachment 2, # 3 Civil Cover Sheet, # 4 Summons for Francis M. Collins, # 5 Summons for Xavier Becerra)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/10/2021)
09/10/2021	8	LCvR 26.1 CERTIFICATE OF DISCLOSURE of Corporate Affiliations and Financial Interests by PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/10/2021)
09/10/2021	9	MOTION to Permit <i>Omission of Home Address from Caption</i> by MADELINE KRASNO. (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support, # 2 Text of Proposed Order) (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 09/10/2021)
09/13/2021		Case Assigned to Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell. (zsb) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021	10	STANDING ORDER. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING plaintiffs' 2 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Katherine Fallow as Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs. Ms. Fallow may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing plaintiffs in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a). Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING plaintiffs' 3 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Stephanie Krent as Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs. Ms. Krent may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing plaintiffs in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a). Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING plaintiffs' 4 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Lyndsey Wajert as Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs. Ms. Wajert may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing plaintiffs in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a). Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the 5 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Caitlin M. Foley as Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs Ryan Hartkopf and Madeline Krasno. Ms. Foley may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing only plaintiffs Ryan Hartkopf and Madeline Krasno in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a). Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)
09/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the 6 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Asher Smith as Additional Counsel for Plaintiff People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals. Mr. Smith may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing only plaintiff People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a). Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 13, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/13/2021)

09/14/2021	11	SUMMONS (2) Issued Electronically as to XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Attachments: # 1 Notice and Consent)(znmw) (Entered: 09/14/2021)
09/14/2021		<p>MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING 9 Plaintiff Madeline Krasno's Motion for Permission to Omit Home Address from Caption ("Pl.'s Mot.").</p> <p>Generally, "[t]he first filing by or on behalf of a party shall have in the caption the . . . full residence address of the party," and "[f]ailure to provide the address information within 30 days of filing may result in the dismissal of the case against the defendant." LCvR 5.1(c)(1). Courts apply the factors identified in <i>United States v. Hubbard</i>, 650 F.2d 293 (D.C. Cir. 1980), to determine when a party's privacy interests are sufficiently weighty to overcome the general presumption in favor of public access to information concerning judicial proceedings.</p> <p>Here, an evaluation of all the <i>Hubbard</i> factors supports granting plaintiff's request. Plaintiff notes that as a component of her advocacy work on controversial topics concerning animal testing, she must maintain a robust social media presence. Pl.'s Mot. at 2. In this capacity, she has already experienced unwanted harassment and attention unconnected to the subject matter of her advocacy, and reasonably fears that "her safety will be at risk due to potential trolls and stalkers" should her home address become a matter of public record. <i>Id.</i> Further, plaintiff convincingly explains the lack of prejudice to the government defendants in this case of omitting her home address, as well as the lack of public interest in her home address with respect to this litigation. <i>See id.</i> at 3. Under these circumstances, sufficient cause exists to grant plaintiff's request to omit her home address from filings with this Court.</p> <p>Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on September 14, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 09/14/2021)</p>
09/15/2021	12	NOTICE of Appearance by Caitlin Mairead Foley on behalf of RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO (Foley, Caitlin) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
09/15/2021	13	NOTICE of Appearance by Stephanie Krent on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
09/15/2021	14	NOTICE of Appearance by Katherine Amy Fallow on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Fallow, Katherine) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
09/15/2021	15	NOTICE of Appearance by Lyndsey Marie Wajert on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Wajert, Lyndsey) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
09/15/2021	16	NOTICE of Appearance by Asher Smith on behalf of PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS (Smith, Asher) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
09/15/2021	17	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. Attorney Lyndsey Marie Wajert terminated. (Wajert, Lyndsey) (Entered: 09/15/2021)
10/28/2021	18	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. XAVIER BECERRA served on 9/20/2021 (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 10/28/2021)
10/28/2021	19	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed on United States Attorney General. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney General 9/21/2021. (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 10/28/2021)
10/28/2021	20	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to the United States Attorney. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney on 10/7/2021.

		Answer due for ALL FEDERAL DEFENDANTS by 12/6/2021. (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 10/28/2021)
11/09/2021	21	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. FRANCIS M. COLLINS served on 11/8/2021 (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 11/09/2021)
11/23/2021	22	NOTICE of Appearance by Kuntal Virendra Cholera on behalf of All Defendants (Cholera, Kuntal) (Main Document 22 replaced on 11/24/2021) (zeg). (Entered: 11/23/2021)
11/23/2021	23	Joint MOTION for Briefing Schedule <i>and to Stay Answer Deadline</i> by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 11/23/2021)
11/24/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 23 Joint Motion for Entry of Briefing Schedule; STAYING the deadline for defendants to file their answer(s) until further order of the Court; and ISSUING the following SCHEDULING ORDER to govern proceedings in this matter: (1) by December 8, 2021, the parties shall file a joint stipulation of facts; (2) by January 14, 2022, plaintiffs shall file their motion for summary judgment; (3) by February 11, 2022, defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and response to plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment; (4) by March 2, 2022, plaintiffs shall file their response to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment and any reply in support of their own motion for summary judgment; and (5) by March 18, 2022, defendants shall file any reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on November 24, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 11/24/2021)
11/24/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint stipulation of facts due by 12/8/2021. Plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment due by 1/14/2022. Defendants' cross-motion and response to plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment due by 2/11/2022. Plaintiffs' response to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment and any reply in support of their motion for summary judgment due by 3/2/2022. Defendants' reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment due by 3/18/2022. (hmc) (Entered: 11/24/2021)
12/03/2021	24	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>file Fact Stipulation</i> by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 12/03/2021)
12/06/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 24 Joint Motion for Extension of Time and MODIFYING the SCHEDULING ORDER previously entered in this matter, <i>see</i> Min. Order (Nov. 24, 2021), only as follows: by December 16, 2021, the parties shall file their joint stipulation of facts. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on December 6, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 12/06/2021)
12/06/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint stipulation of facts due by 12/16/2021. (ztg) (Entered: 12/06/2021)
12/15/2021	25	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Stipulation</i> by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 12/15/2021)
12/15/2021		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 25 Joint Motion for Further Extension of Time; STAYING the briefing schedule set forth in the Minute Order issued November 24, 2021; and DIRECTING the parties to file, by January 14, 2022, their joint stipulation of fact <i>and</i> a joint status report proposing a schedule for further proceedings. If the parties wish to seek a further extension of time to file the joint stipulation of fact, they shall file an appropriate motion by January 10, 2022, pursuant to paragraph 7(b) of the 10 Standing Order in this case. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on December 15, 2021. (lcbah3) (Entered: 12/15/2021)

12/15/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint stipulation of fact and joint status report due by 1/14/2022. (ztg) (Entered: 12/15/2021)
01/10/2022	26	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Fact Stipulation and Proposed Schedule for Proceedings</i> by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 01/10/2022)
01/11/2022		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 26 Joint Motion for Further Extension of Time; and DIRECTING the parties to file, by January 28, 2022, their joint stipulation of fact <i>and</i> a joint status report proposing a schedule for further proceedings. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on January 11, 2022. (lcbah3) (Entered: 01/11/2022)
01/12/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Stipulation of Fact and Joint Status Report due by 1/28/2022. (ztg) (Entered: 01/12/2022)
01/24/2022	27	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Fact Stipulation and Proposed Schedule for Proceedings</i> by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 01/24/2022)
01/25/2022		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 27 Joint Motion for Further Extension of Time; and DIRECTING the parties to file, by February 11, 2022, their joint stipulation of fact <i>and</i> a joint status report proposing a schedule for further proceedings. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on January 25, 2022. (lcbah3) (Entered: 01/25/2022)
01/25/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Response to Order of the Court due by 2/11/2022. (ztg) (Entered: 01/25/2022)
02/11/2022	28	STIPULATION (<i>Joint</i>) by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13, # 14 Exhibit 14, # 15 Exhibit 15, # 16 Exhibit 16, # 17 Exhibit 17, # 18 Exhibit 18, # 19 Exhibit 19, # 20 Exhibit 20, # 21 Exhibit 21, # 22 Exhibit 22, # 23 Exhibit 23, # 24 Exhibit 24, # 25 Exhibit 25, # 26 Exhibit 26, # 27 Exhibit 27, # 28 Exhibit 28, # 29 Exhibit 29, # 30 Exhibit 30, # 31 Exhibit 31, # 32 Exhibit 32, # 33 Exhibit 33, # 34 Exhibit 34, # 35 Exhibit 35, # 36 Exhibit 36, # 37 Exhibit 37, # 38 Exhibit 38, # 39 Exhibit 39, # 40 Exhibit 40, # 41 Exhibit 41, # 42 Exhibit 42, # 43 Exhibit 43, # 44 Exhibit 44, # 45 Exhibit 45, # 46 Exhibit 46, # 47 Exhibit 47, # 48 Exhibit 48, # 49 Exhibit 49, # 50 Exhibit 50, # 51 Exhibit 51, # 52 Exhibit 52, # 53 Exhibit 53, # 54 Exhibit 54, # 55 Exhibit 55, # 56 Index of Exhibits)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 02/11/2022)
02/11/2022	29	Joint STATUS REPORT by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 02/11/2022)
02/24/2022		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) ISSUING, in light of the parties' 29 Joint Status Report, the following SCHEDULING ORDER: (1) by April 1, 2022, plaintiffs shall file their motion for summary judgment; (2) by May 6, 2022, defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiffs' motion; (3) by May 27, 2022, plaintiffs shall file their opposition to defendants' cross-motion and reply in support of plaintiffs' motion; and (4) by June 17, 2022, defendants shall file their reply in support of their cross-motion; WAIVING the requirement of LCvR 7(h) that any motion for or opposition to summary judgment include a statement of material facts; and STAYING, until 30 days after the resolution of the anticipated motion and cross-motion

		for summary judgment, all deadlines that would otherwise be applicable under Fed R. Civ. P. 26, Fed. R. Civ P. 16, LCvR 16.3, and paragraph 3 of the 10 Standing Order. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on February 24, 2022. (lcbah3) (Entered: 02/24/2022)
02/24/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Summary judgment motion due by 4/1/2022; cross-motion/opposition to motion for summary judgment due by 5/6/2022; opposition to cross-motion and reply to opposition to motion for summary judgment due by 5/27/2022; reply to opposition to cross-motion due by 6/17/2022. (ztg) (Entered: 02/24/2022)
04/01/2022	30	MOTION for Summary Judgment by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support, # 2 Text of Proposed Order)(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 04/01/2022)
05/06/2022	31	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum in Support, # 2 Exhibit A, # 3 Exhibit B) (Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 05/06/2022)
05/06/2022	32	Memorandum in opposition to re 30 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (See Docket Entry 31 to view document). (zeg) (Entered: 05/11/2022)
05/26/2022	33	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Alyssa Morones, Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number ADCDC-9265080. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration, # 2 Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 05/26/2022)
05/26/2022		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING plaintiffs' 33 Motion for Admission <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> of Alyssa Morones as Additional Counsel for Plaintiffs. Ms. Morones may enter an appearance <i>pro hac vice</i> for the purpose of representing plaintiffs in this action. Counsel should register for e-filing via PACER and file a notice of appearance pursuant to LCvR 83.6(a) Click for instructions. Signed by Chief Judge Beryl A. Howell on May 26, 2022. (lcbah3) (Entered: 05/26/2022)
05/27/2022	34	Memorandum in opposition to re 31 Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 56, # 2 Exhibit 57)(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 05/27/2022)
05/27/2022	35	REPLY to opposition to motion re 30 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 56, # 2 Exhibit 57)(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 05/27/2022)
05/27/2022		COUNSEL IS TO DISREGARD THIS ENTRY, SEE DE#35..... NOTICE OF ERROR re 34 Memorandum in Opposition; emailed to stephanie.krent@knightcolumbia.org, cc'd 8 associated attorneys -- The PDF file you docketed contained errors: 1. Please note the following deficiency and file/refile document as instructed , 2. Two-part document; second docket entry is required, 3. Please file using the event reply to opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment. (zeg,) Modified on 5/31/2022 (zjf). (Entered: 05/27/2022)
05/31/2022	36	NOTICE of Appearance by Alyssa Morones on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Morones, Alyssa) (Entered: 05/31/2022)

06/17/2022	37	REPLY to opposition to motion re 31 Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 06/17/2022)
08/16/2022	38	NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/16/2022)
08/24/2022	39	RESPONSE re 38 NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY filed by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS. (Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 08/24/2022)
11/29/2022	40	NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY by XAVIER BECERRA, FRANCIS M. COLLINS (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A)(Cholera, Kuntal) (Entered: 11/29/2022)
12/08/2022	41	RESPONSE re 40 NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY filed by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 12/08/2022)
12/22/2022	42	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. Attorney Alyssa Morones terminated. (Morones, Alyssa) (Entered: 12/22/2022)
03/31/2023	43	ORDER DENYING plaintiffs' 30 Motion for Summary Judgment and GRANTING defendants' 31 Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment. See Order for further details. The Clerk of the Court is directed to close this case. Signed by Judge Beryl A. Howell on March 31, 2023. (lcbah3) (Entered: 03/31/2023)
03/31/2023	44	MEMORANDUM OPINION regarding plaintiffs' 30 Motion for Summary Judgment and defendants' 31 Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment. Signed by Judge Beryl A. Howell on March 31, 2023. (lcbah3) (Entered: 03/31/2023)
05/11/2023	45	NOTICE OF APPEAL TO DC CIRCUIT COURT as to 43 Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, 44 Order on Motion for Summary Judgment by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number ADCDC-10063107. Fee Status: Fee Paid. Parties have been notified. (Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 05/11/2023)
05/15/2023	46	Transmission of the Notice of Appeal, Order Appealed (Memorandum Opinion), and Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals. The Court of Appeals fee was paid re 45 Notice of Appeal to DC Circuit Court. (zed) (Entered: 05/15/2023)
05/16/2023		USCA Case Number 23-5110 for 45 Notice of Appeal to DC Circuit Court, filed by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (znmw) (Entered: 05/16/2023)
12/06/2023	47	Consent MOTION for an Indicative Ruling by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order on Consent Motion for an Indicative Ruling, # 2 Consent Motion to Dismiss Claims with Prejudice, # 3 Text of Proposed Order on Consent Motion to Dismiss Claims with Prejudice)(Fallow, Katherine) (Entered: 12/06/2023)
12/06/2023		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING the parties' 47 Consent Motion for an Indicative Ruling; and INDICATING, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 62.1, that the Court would grant the parties' [47-2] Consent Motion to Dismiss Remaining Claims with Prejudice, if the Court of Appeals remanded the case for this limited purpose. Signed by Judge Beryl A. Howell on December 6, 2023. (lcbah1) (Entered: 12/06/2023)

01/08/2024	48	ORDER of USCA as to 45 Notice of Appeal to DC Circuit Court, filed by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS ; case remanded to district court. USCA Case Number 23-5110. (znmw) (Entered: 01/08/2024)
01/11/2024	49	Consent MOTION to Dismiss <i>Claims with Prejudice and Transmit Back to the DC Circuit</i> by RYAN HARTKOPF, MADELINE KRASNO, PEOPLE FOR THE ETHICAL TREATMENT OF ANIMALS. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Fallow, Katherine) (Entered: 01/11/2024)
01/11/2024		MINUTE ORDER (paperless) GRANTING plaintiffs' 49 Consent Motion to Dismiss Claims with Prejudice, and DISMISSING, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2), the remaining claims against defendant Xavier Becerra regarding the U.S. Department of Health and Human Service's Facebook page. Signed by Judge Beryl A. Howell on January 11, 2024. (lcbah1) (Entered: 01/11/2024)